

The result (5.44) essentially proves the Gauss-Markov Theorem, since it implies that

$$\begin{aligned} & E(\check{\beta} - \beta_0)(\check{\beta} - \beta_0)^\top \\ &= E\left(\left((\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{C} \mathbf{u}\right)\left((\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{C} \mathbf{u}\right)^\top\right) \\ &= \sigma_0^2 (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} + \sigma_0^2 \mathbf{C} \mathbf{C}^\top. \end{aligned} \quad (5.45)$$

Thus the difference between the covariance matrices of $\check{\beta}$ and $\hat{\beta}$ is $\sigma_0^2 \mathbf{C} \mathbf{C}^\top$, which is a positive semidefinite matrix. Notice that the assumption that $E(\mathbf{u} \mathbf{u}^\top) = \sigma_0^2 \mathbf{I}$ is crucial here. If instead we had $E(\mathbf{u} \mathbf{u}^\top) = \boldsymbol{\Omega}$, with $\boldsymbol{\Omega}$ an arbitrary $n \times n$ positive definite matrix, the last line of (5.45) would be

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top \boldsymbol{\Omega} \mathbf{X} (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} \\ &+ \mathbf{C} \boldsymbol{\Omega} \mathbf{C}^\top + (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top \boldsymbol{\Omega} \mathbf{C}^\top + \mathbf{C} \boldsymbol{\Omega} \mathbf{X} (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1}, \end{aligned}$$

and we could draw no conclusion about the relative efficiency of $\check{\beta}$ and $\hat{\beta}$.

As a simple example of the Gauss-Markov Theorem in action, suppose that $\check{\beta}$ is the OLS estimator obtained by regressing \mathbf{y} on \mathbf{X} and \mathbf{Z} jointly, where \mathbf{Z} is a matrix of regressors such that $E(\mathbf{y} | \mathbf{X}, \mathbf{Z}) = E(\mathbf{y} | \mathbf{X}) = \mathbf{X} \boldsymbol{\beta}$. Since the information that \mathbf{Z} does not belong in the regression is being ignored when we construct $\check{\beta}$, the latter must in general be inefficient. Using the FWL Theorem, we find that

$$\check{\beta} = (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{y}, \quad (5.46)$$

where, as usual, \mathbf{M}_Z is the matrix that projects orthogonally onto $\mathcal{S}^\perp(\mathbf{Z})$. If we write $\check{\beta}$ as in (5.42), we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \check{\beta} &= (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{y} + ((\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z - (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top) \mathbf{y} \\ &= (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{y} + (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{X})^{-1} (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z - \mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{X} (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top) \mathbf{y} \\ &= (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{y} + (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{X})^{-1} (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{X} (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top)) \mathbf{y} \\ &= (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{y} + (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{M}_X \mathbf{y} \\ &= \hat{\beta} + \mathbf{C} \mathbf{y}. \end{aligned} \quad (5.47)$$

Thus, in this case, the matrix \mathbf{C} is the matrix $(\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{M}_X$. We see that the inefficient estimator $\check{\beta}$ is equal to the efficient estimator $\hat{\beta}$ plus a random component which is uncorrelated with it. That $\hat{\beta}$ and $\mathbf{C} \mathbf{y}$ are uncorrelated follows from the fact (required for $\mathbf{C} \mathbf{y}$ to have mean zero) that $\mathbf{C} \mathbf{X} = \mathbf{0}$, which is true because \mathbf{M}_X annihilates \mathbf{X} . Further, we see that

$$\begin{aligned} & E(\check{\beta} - \beta_0)(\check{\beta} - \beta_0)^\top = \sigma_0^2 (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{X})^{-1} \\ &+ \sigma_0^2 (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{X})^{-1} \mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{M}_X \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{X} (\mathbf{X}^\top \mathbf{M}_Z \mathbf{X})^{-1}. \end{aligned} \quad (5.48)$$